

Canfield, Ohio
April 11, 2016

The Regular Meeting of the Board of Park Commissioners of Mill Creek MetroParks was held on Monday, April 11, 2016, at the MetroParks Farm. President John Ragan welcomed guests and staff.

The meeting opened at 6 p.m. with recitation of The Pledge of Allegiance. Roll Call was as follows: Germaine Bennett, present, Bob Durick, present; John Ragan, present; and Scott Schulick, present.

John Ragan presented the Minutes of the Meeting of March 14, 2016, and asked that they be approved. Scott Schulick motioned they be approved. The motion was seconded by Germaine Bennett and passed, and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Durick, Ragan, Schulick
Voting Nay: None

Kevin Smith, Treasurer/Administrative Services Director, presented the Treasurer's Report. After discussion, Bob Durick moved, the funds having been certified as on hand and duly appropriated, that disbursements #70045 - #70297 be approved. The motion was seconded by Germaine Bennett and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Durick, Ragan, Schulick
Voting Nay: None

John Ragan opened up discussion about changing the park's hours of closing. After discussion, the Board asked that a formal proposal be presented at the next Board Meeting, for changing the hours on the MetroParks Bikeway, and on East Golf Hike/Bike Trail.

Aaron Young, Executive Director requested that the Board approve his nomination to the OPWC Natural Resources Assistance Council. After discussion, Germaine Bennett motioned that the nomination be approved. The motion was seconded by Bob Durick and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Durick, Ragan, Schulick
Voting Nay: None

Aaron spoke regarding the renewal of the Yellow Creek Park Lease. After discussion, Scott Schulick motioned that the renewal be approved. The motion was seconded by Bob Durick and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Durick, Ragan, Schulick
Voting Nay: None

Aaron presented tabulations for proposals for a 12-month lease of the WPA structure at the Kirk Road Trailhead on the MetroParks Bikeway, for the rental of bicycles and other equipment.

MILL CREEK METROPARKS BIKEWAY – KIRK ROAD LEASE AGREEMENT

Consideration of a lease and rental services at the Kirk Road Trailhead facility in Austintown Township along the Mill Creek MetroParks Bikeway.

PROPOSALS DUE: April 8, 2016 @ 4:30pm

ESTIMATE TOTAL: Total of 1.) Monthly Facility Rental Fee, and
2.) Total Percentage of Rental and Retail Sales

Name of Bidder	Total Amount of Bid as Read at Bid Opening	Total Amount of Bid After Tabulation
Foust Construction, Inc. (Girard, OH)	\$88,470.50	\$88,470.50
Marucci & Gaffney Excavating Co. (Youngstown, OH)	\$105,394.25	\$105,394.25
Daniel A. Terreri & Sons, Inc. (Youngstown, OH)	\$88,000.00	\$88,000.00

NOTES:

1. Three (3) bids were received, checked and tabulated. The total amount of each of the three (3) bids after tabulation was within the 10% bid cap.
2. No errors were found in any of the three (3) bids.
3. The low bidder at bid opening and after tabulation is Daniel A. Terreri & Sons, Inc.
4. The low bidder is currently prequalified with ODOT to perform the work specified in the plans.
5. All required bonds, documents, forms and attachments were included with Daniel A. Terreri & Sons Inc.'s bid.
6. Daniel A Terreri & Sons, Inc. is experienced in the type of work required and has satisfactorily completed other MetroParks improvement projects, including the recent Rehabilitation of Stone Arch Bridges project.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. It is recommended that Daniel A. Terreri & Sons, Inc. be awarded the contract for the project named "Reconstruction of Lily Pond Parking Lot" at the grand total amount bid of \$88,000.00.

Scott Schulick motioned that the bid of Daniel Terreri & Sons, Inc. be accepted, it being the lowest and best bid. The motion was seconded by Bob Durick and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Durick, Ragan, Schulick

Voting Nay: None

Steve Avery, Planning & Operations Director, presented the following Resolution for approval:

R-16-02

REHABILITATION of EAST COHASSET DRIVE, PHASE II

WHEREAS, East Cohasset Drive was constructed in 1892 as the first drive in Mill Creek Park and is a contributing feature to the Mill Creek Park Historic District, and the northerly 1.07 miles of the drive needs to be rehabilitated, and

WHEREAS, rehabilitation of East Cohasset Drive is a transportation activity eligible to receive federal funding, and therefore Mill Creek MetroParks applied for Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) Transportation Alternatives Program funding in August 2015 through the Eastgate Regional Council of Governments (Eastgate) for rehabilitation of the northerly segment of East Cohasset Drive at a total estimated cost of \$364,100, and

WHEREAS, Eastgate's General Policy Board approved Resolution #040-2015 on January 25, 2016, which officially added the East Cohasset Drive rehabilitation project to the State of Ohio's Transportation Improvement Program and authorized the cost for this project to be financed at 80% using FHWA Transportation Alternatives Program funds, and

WHEREAS, FHWA has designated the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT) as the agency in Ohio to administer federally funded transportation projects, and

WHEREAS, Section 5501.03 (C) of the Ohio Revised Code provides that the Director of ODOT may coordinate activities of the Department with other appropriate public authorities and enter into contracts with such authorities as necessary to carry out its duties, powers and functions, and

WHEREAS, it is the mutual desire of both ODOT and Mill Creek MetroParks to have the MetroParks serve as the responsible lead agency for the management of this project.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, the Board of Park Commissioners of the Mill Creek Metropolitan Park District agree as follows:

1. The Mill Creek MetroParks' Executive Director is hereby authorized and directed to file the programming and environmental documents with ODOT, and to execute an Agreement with ODOT for the East Cohasset Drive rehabilitation project, and
2. The Mill Creek MetroParks' Executive Director is hereby authorized and directed to have plans and specifications prepared for advertisement of public bids for the project, and
3. The Board of Park Commissioners agrees to the future maintenance of the project, and
4. The Board of Park Commissioners agrees to pay all costs in excess of the amount funded by FHWA.

Germaine Bennett motioned that the resolution be accepted. The motion was seconded by Scott Schulick and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Durick, Ragan, Schulick
Voting Nay: None

Carol Vigorito, Recreation and Education Director, presented the following special event requests for approval:

1. Request of Canfield Cross Country Boosters to hold their Cardinal Classic – Pajama Run 5K & 15K fundraiser on the MetroParks Bikeway on Sunday, June 19, 2016.
2. Request of YMCA to hold the cycling portion of their Triathlon fundraiser throughout the MetroParks from Price Rd. to Canfield Rd., on Sunday, July 17, 2016.
3. Request of Covelli Enterprises to hold their Panerathon 10K fundraiser in the Lake Glacier Area, on Sunday, August 21, 2016
4. Request of YMCA to hold their Community Cup fundraiser in the Wick Recreation Area, on Saturday, September 10, 2016.

Scott Schulick motioned that the requests be approved. The motion was seconded by Germaine Bennett and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Durick, Ragan, Schulick
Voting Nay: None

Brian Tolnar, Golf Course Director, presented the following special event requests for approval:

1. Senator Schiavoni Outing on Friday, May 6, 2016 (both courses). Facility closed until 1:30 p.m. (year #4 for the event at Mill Creek) (Brian Tolnar, PGA Director of Golf)
2. Golf Course – The Vindy's Greatest Golfer on Friday, August 19, 2016 (both courses). Facility closed until 5 p.m. (year #6 for the event at Mill Creek.) (Brian)

Bob Durick motioned that the requests be approved. The motion was seconded by Scott Schulick and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Durick, Ragan, Schulick
Voting Nay: None

Brian presented the Board with a "2016 Golf Rate Assessment & Analysis" packet, and requested that the rates at the Golf Course, and the Par 3 Golf Course be set as follows, effective April 18, 2016:

Golf Course		Junior/Senior Rate	Mahoning County <u>Resident</u> Rate	Regular Rate <u>NR</u>
9 Holes		\$7.50 \$8.00	\$10.00 \$11.00	\$12.50 \$14.50
9 Holes with Cart		\$13.00	\$16.00	\$19.50
18 Holes		\$15.00 \$16.00	\$20.00 \$22.00	\$25.00 \$29.00
18 Holes with Cart		\$26.00	\$32.00	\$39.00
9 Holes	After September 30	\$7.00	\$9.50	\$12.00
18 Holes	After September 30	\$14.00	\$18.00	\$24.00
Golf Car 9 Holes		\$10.00	\$10.00	\$10.00
Golf Car 18 Holes		\$20.00	\$20.00	\$20.00
Golf Car 9 Holes	Single Rider	\$5.00	\$5.00	\$5.00
Golf Car 18 Holes	Single Rider	\$10.00	\$10.00	\$10.00
Pull Carts	Per 9 holes	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$1.00

Wick Recreation Area		Junior/Senior Rate	Mahoning County <u>Resident</u> Rate	Regular Rate <u>NR</u>
Par 3 Golf	9 Holes	\$3.50 \$4.00	\$4.00 \$5.00	\$4.50 \$6.00
	18 Holes	\$7.00 \$8.00	\$8.00 \$10.00	\$9.00 \$12.00
	9 Holes evening	\$4.25 \$5.00	\$4.75 \$5.50	\$5.25 \$6.50
Golf Club Rental		\$1.75	\$1.75	\$1.75

Bob Durick motioned that the requests be approved. The motion was seconded by Scott Schulick and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Durick, Ragan, Schulick
Voting Nay: None

Aaron presented a Letter of Support: Mahoning River Bikeway & MCMP Spur via FRG.

Steve and Justin provided an informative PowerPoint presentation on the "MetroParks Bikeway – Phase III".

Commissioners Comments:

- Bob Durick welcomed guests to the board meeting. He asked about meeting locations.

- John Ragan read a letter from Commissioner Mike Senchak, announcing his resignation as a Commissioner from the Mill Creek MetroParks Board.

March 24, 2016

Robert N. Rusu, Judge
Mahoning County Probate Court
120 Market Street
Youngstown, OH 44503

Dear Judge Rusu:

I am writing to officially announce my resignation as a Commissioner from the Mill Creek Metroparks Board. Please note that this resignation is effective immediately.

Just to make sure there is no misunderstanding or wrong interpretation of my resignation, I want to clearly state that I do support the reorganization plan that was implemented earlier this year. I also want to express my support of Executive Director Aaron Young, my fellow Commissioners/Board Members, and a special thanks to our Board President, John Ragan, for being the spokesperson for me and the other Commissioners during these past few weeks.

During the Board meeting held on Monday March 14, 2016, over 40 individuals took the opportunity to address those in attendance. Of those that spoke, many were volunteers, and by the end of the meeting they had offered a plethora of comments and ideas. But make no mistake about it, the one common theme that was loud and clear, was their love of the Park.

This is a critical time, and I believe the majority of our community's time and efforts should be focused on moving forward and collaborating in attaining the Park's future goals. During this time of change, it appears to me that this is an opportune time to infuse ideas and leadership from one of the Park's many significant collaborators. While I believe there are many individuals and groups that support the Park, there is none more important, in my opinion, than our numerous volunteers.

I would like to close with a few comments I publicly stated when I had the opportunity to speak at the March 14th meeting, and would hope others share in my feelings - my specific comments were as follows:

"I do look forward to collaborating with and working together with those focused on our future. There is no doubt in my mind that the implementation of the plan discussed tonight will lead to an enhanced Mill Creek Metropark System over the next 15 years."

I would like to personally thank you for the confidence you had in naming me to the Park Board as a Commissioner. Please know that I will continue to support you, and those affiliated with the Mill Creek Metroparks, in your future endeavors and success.

Sincerely,


Michael S. Senchak

-
- Scott Schulick read the following statement:

REMARKS

MILL CREEK PARK BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING

SCOTT R. SCHULICK

APRIL 11, 2016

President Theodore Roosevelt is known for saying: "Nothing in the world is worth having or worth doing unless it means effort, pain, difficulty..." That is how I will sum up my experience as a member of the Mill Creek MetroParks Board of Commissioners the past sixteen months. Serving as a park commissioner has been an extremely frustrating position to hold. The park's challenges are more than overwhelming, with some issue requiring immediate attention, while others will need to be accomplished over longer time frames, if the park is to succeed going forward.

I have spent the time since our March board meeting responding to all telephone calls and emails I have received, as well as meeting with individuals who have invited me to do so. Through those interactions I have learned much about the frustrations many individuals and groups have with Mill Creek MetroParks, both current and historical. Are there legitimate concerns? Yes. There are individuals whose concerns I share on several issues. I believe that I have been listening and hearing all of the concerns raised, however that does not mean that I agree with every point of view, or that individually I am positioned to address each one. Conversely, are there some uniformed, impossible presumptions and theories? Yes, indeed. There are many questions that have been asked of the Board, for which we simply do not have answers, because they are more appropriately answered by management and staff.

I do believe that it is important to clarify that a board sets policy and management is responsible for carrying out that policy. However, the problem we face here at Mill Creek is that we do not have our policies developed or codified in a consistent or meaningful way. With that in mind, I'd like to offer the following issues and policies that I believe the board needs to begin working on immediately relative to the governance of Mill Creek MetroParks:

- 1.) Convene a facilitated Board/Staff Retreat or Workshop to develop procedures to update or develop board by-laws and policies on topics including, but not limited to:
 - Board governance
 - Promulgation, Amendment and Repeal process for board by-laws, rules and policies
 - Election of board officers
 - Orientation of New Commissioners
 - Board Meeting Structure including meeting frequency and agenda development
 - Staff reports
 - Board education sessions
 - Development of Board Committee Structure to discuss issues and a process to forward to the board for approval
 - Park Structure and Administration
 - Selection and Evaluation Process for Executive Director, and other employees
 - Human Resources: personnel policies, job descriptions, union negotiations, etc.

- Budget, Finance, and Audit
- Investment & Spending Policies for both Operating Funds and Endowment Funds
- Strategic Planning and Implementation
- Fundraising/Development:
 - Update or create memorandum of understanding with the Mill Creek MetroParks Foundation
 - Update or create a memorandum of understanding with the Friends of Fellows Riverside Gardens
 - Define roles and responsibilities for fundraising including naming rights, annual fund, major gifts, and capital campaigns

I believe that these two support organizations have distinct, but complementary missions, with the Mill Creek MetroParks Foundation to further the advancement of the entire park in perpetuity through fundraising and endowment building, while Friends of Fellows Riverside Gardens is specifically focused on the mission and advancement of the Gardens. I firmly believe that it is premature to suggest that these groups combine.

- Land Management including: property acquisition, horticulture, forestry, wildlife management
- Review of all existing lease arrangements, contracts, use restrictions, and partnership agreements
- Facilities
- Historic Preservation of Park Structures and Maintenance; and a commitment to maintaining the planned, recreational purpose of the park
- Community Engagement:
 - Education for the general public on how the board functions relative to park management
 - Consideration of an officially sanctioned Citizens Advisory Committee with a clear structure to bring issues to park management and the Board of Commissioners, including a Memorandum of Understanding on how the Advisory Committee will function relative to the Board of Commissioners and park management
 - Volunteers: how they are organized and their function
 - Community Development in neighborhoods adjacent to Mill Creek MetroParks

- 2.) Tour of all Park Lands and Facilities
- 3.) Annual Board Training on the Sunshine Law (Open Meetings and Public Records) by the Ohio Ethics Commission
- 4.) Consider convening a Regional Watershed Task Force to work with surrounding governmental entities and lawmakers to ensure improvement of issues affecting water quality and recreation abilities for Mill Creek MetroParks

- 5.) Update the park budget process to be completed by December 31 each year so that temporary budgets are not needed
 - Enrolling the MetroParks in the Ohio's Online Checkbook program
- 6.) Consider engaging the Ohio Auditor of State, or an independent CPA firm, to conduct an operational review of park functions and offer suggestions for improvement.
- 7.) On-going, annual planning for park levy renewals, currently organized by the People for MetroParks Political Action Committee

These are just some of the issues that require attention. However, I firmly believe that if the Board of Commissioners and park management can work together on these issues, and if the general public will recognize that completing such tasks will require significant and tedious work over time, Mill Creek MetroParks will continue to succeed in a very important way to provide an enhanced quality of life to the residents of our region and beyond.

Again, I sincerely thank you for the opportunity to serve Mill Creek MetroParks. I submit these remarks for the official record.

Thank you.

- Germaine Bennett relayed that she appreciated interacting with the public, and wants to keep an open dialog. She is in agreement with Scott's statement. She thanked Steve & Justin for the education about the Bikeway.

Public Comments:

- Chris Peyko commented on tonight's attendance. He thanked the staff for fulfilling public records requests. He listed the staff whose jobs were eliminated, with their job duties.
- Judy Peyko commented on the recent Jeep purchases, printing of the strategic plan fliers, about lawyers we have hired, gasoline, and the Friends of Fellows Riverside Gardens organization merging with the Mill Creek Park Foundation.
- Tracie Balentine stated that the presentations by employees this evening were informative. She requested the budget for Phase III of the MetroParks Bikeway. She thanked Ms. Bennett, Mr. Schulick, and Mr. Durick for communication. Suggested input from the community on the environmental documents for Phase III of the Bikeway. Suggested focus groups.
- Bobbi Allen, representing the group Recipes of Youngstown, explained the history of the cookbook project, and that it was for replacing, not repairing, the water wheel at Lanterman's Mill. Requested paperwork on how the funds from the cookbook sales were used.
- Jeff Harvey commented on a recent article in the Vindicator, lack of communication at meetings, and meeting in private.
- Lois Martin-Uscianowski asked for follow through on what is said at meetings. She commented on programs at Fellows Riverside Gardens, educators, golf. She expressed that the public wants to be heard and communicated with.
- Lana VanAuken from the Youngstown Camera Club, speaking for her mom, about how the animals and staff have been treated. She spoke about legacies. She thanked Ray Novotny.
- William Heckman spoke about team, intimidation, Aaron Young, Geauga Park Dist., monies at Fellows Riverside Gardens, and management.

- Angie Bradian spoke regarding the otter trapped at the Sanctuary. She mentioned that through a public records request she received the 2009 study of the Sanctuary from the Cleveland Museum of Natural History, and it is different than a copy of that document from a member of the public. She felt this was falsification of records. She listed the differences.
- Gina Centofanti spoke about the Sanctuary, habitat, trapping, fur being sold, listed animals, and questioned Mr. Volpe's connections.
- Cathy Pannunzio spoke about animals, geese, suggested we reexamine the wildlife killing, and putting a wildlife specialist on staff.
- Gunther Lange spoke about animal casualty sensitivity, manor of firings, value of human talent, experience, volunteers, and legacies.
- Elsie Dursi requested new leadership beginning with the removal of Aaron Young. She questioned how much consultants were paid for the internal reorganization, how many volunteers quit.
- Beth Haddle thanked Mr. Schulick and Mr. Ragan for their email responses. She explained that the garden club members are upset about the room rental changes. She spoke about negative comments surrounding Aaron Young, volunteers, donors, and maintaining relationships. She mentioned that the Dahlia Society has moved their event out of the park.
- Bill Black had a handout of his analysis of a recent Vindy article. He suggested the Board go into Executive Session and that Aaron Young be removed. He questioned how the terminations were handled. Spoke about the lack of rangers at Fellows Riverside Gardens, and what the results will be with weddings and dogs.
- Pam Garver, trained under Ellen Speicher in the Master Gardener program. Stated that she will not be back with her iris club until Aaron Young is gone, and the Master Gardener program is reinstated.
- Jeff Barone, financial adviser spoke about the MetroParks system. He reviewed Aaron Young's financial presentation and felt it was sound. He commented that the MetroParks has had 5 directors in 7 years, and 8 in the last 15 year levy period. He supports the Board and Aaron.
- Janet Yaniglos, past president of Friends of Fellows Riverside Gardens. She was speaking on behalf of public gardens. She spoke about the growth at Fellows Riverside Gardens, staffing, volunteers, and managing with less resources.
- Candice LaRocca spoke about the mill, animal killing cover-up, firings, nature, attitude towards community, new natural resources department, altered documents, and Ray Novotny. She requested that the Board consider halting all improvement projects until the water system is fixed. She asked that Aaron Young be removed.
- Pearl Sinistro spoke about respect for wildlife, animal trapping, fur, and the Vindy article on the Baby Shower farm animals.
- Karyn Rovder questioned why Germaine was unaware of the termination, the justification for purchasing 3 vehicles, and loss of staff.
- Liz Ramsey stated that a lack of information and respect for the community was important. She asked for a total of the check registers every month. She said that the yearly appropriations should be in the minutes of the meetings, that information should be available to the public on our website.
- Julie Robinson stated that the community never came to meetings before because they assumed the Park was being run properly. She felt that what we teach in the nature education programs was in disagreement with our allowing trappers on the property. She attends and enjoys MetroMutts programs, and kayaks regularly. She spoke about dead animals/fish on the lakes.
- Deby Clark, a MetroParks supporter, and volunteer, asked why Fellows Riverside Gardens was a target for the job eliminations, why the security was removed at the Gardens, and how many hours will the MetroParks police be at the Gardens. Aaron spoke about the plan for using MetroParks police for the Gardens, and that the goal was to have no change in performance.
- Judy Peyko turned in petitions to have Aaron removed. Asked why Aaron was against older people. Spoke about the terminations, dahlia society moving locations, and read the statement from Poland Village thanking the MetroParks staff that were lost, that volunteered for their park.
- Mark Cleland asked about transparency, board responsibility, lack of dialog with taxpayers, and broken public trust. He suggested that everyone should have a microphone and a podium.

- Bill Adams thanked Scott Schulick for his comments. Feels that the math doesn't add up, levy dollars, Friends of Fellows Riverside Gardens dollars, and capital improvements. Asked why no staff cuts were mentioned previously. Suggested public meetings on the budget, capital improvements, wildlife policy, and land gas leases.
- Judy Peyko spoke about money from the Friends of FRG organization, money discrepancies, power, control, merging Friends of FRG and MCMP Foundations, and asked that Ray Novotny be given his Naturalist Emeritus status. She asked when Aaron Young's termination would be. Mr. Ragan replied that he is not being terminated.

John Ragan announced that the next Regular Board Meeting on Monday, May 9, 2016 will be rescheduled for Monday, May 16, 2016, at 6 p.m. at the MetroParks Farm.

Bob Durick moved the Board meet in Executive Session to discuss the purchase or sale of property, and collective bargaining matters. Scott Schulick seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Germaine Bennett - Aye

Bob Durick - Aye

John Ragan - Aye

Scott Schulick - Aye

The motion was passed, and the Board met in Executive Session at 9:09 p.m.

Germaine Bennett left during the Executive Session.

Bob Durick motioned to return to Regular Session. John Ragan seconded the motion and the Board returned from Executive Session at 10 p.m. The vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Durick, Ragan, Schulick

Voting Nay: None

There being no further business, John Ragan moved to adjourn the meeting. Scott Schulick seconded the motion, and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Durick, Ragan, Schulick

Voting Nay: None

The meeting adjourned at 10:01 p.m.