

Canfield, Ohio  
December 18, 2017

A Special Meeting of the Board of Park Commissioners of Mill Creek MetroParks was held on Monday, December 18, 2017, in the Davis Education & Visitor Center at Fellows Riverside Gardens. President Lee Frey welcomed guests and staff.

The meeting opened at 6 p.m. with recitation of The Pledge of Allegiance. Roll Call was as follows: Germaine Bennett, present, Lee Frey, present, Tom Frost, present; John Ragan, present; and Tom Shipka, present.

Kevin Smith, Finance Director presented the Finance Director's report. Lee Frey moved, the funds having been certified as on hand and duly appropriated, that disbursements #74806 - #75003, for a total of \$575,677.28 be approved. The motion was seconded by John Ragan. After discussion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Kevin presented the following appropriation adjustment request:

- Request to reduce appropriations to Fund 701- Replacement Reserve by \$468,000.00. This is needed to ensure that the appropriations do not exceed the actual money available in the fund at the end of the year

Lee Frey motioned that the appropriation request be approved. The motion was seconded by Tom Frost, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Kevin Smith presented the 2018 Temporary Budget for approval:

<b>Mill Creek Metropolitan Park District</b>		
<b>2018 Temporary Budget</b>		
		<b><u>General Fund</u></b>
	<b>Materials &amp; Supplies</b>	
Administration	60,000.00	
Marketing & Graphics	20,000.00	
Planning	10,000.00	
Golf	60,000.00	
Horticulture	40,000.00	
Operations	65,000.00	
Recreation	30,000.00	
Police	20,000.00	
<b>Total Materials &amp; Supplies</b>	<b><u>305,000.00</u></b>	
	<b>Salaries &amp; Benefits</b>	
Administration	110,000.00	
Marketing & Graphics	30,000.00	
Planning	50,000.00	
Golf	120,000.00	
Horticulture	105,000.00	
Operations	200,000.00	
Recreation	90,000.00	
Police	180,000.00	
<b>Total Salaries &amp; Benefits</b>	<b><u>885,000.00</u></b>	
<b>Total 2018 Temporary Budget</b>		<b><u>1,190,000.00</u></b>

Lee Frey motioned that the Temporary Budget be approved. The motion was seconded by Tom Shipka, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Lee Frey motioned that the MetroParks give current staff members, who have shown interest, the opportunity to become a Certified Arborist, while the MetroParks continues to contract out forestry services as needed. Germaine Bennett seconded the motion. Discussion ensued.

Tom Shipka motioned to amend the motion to approve of hiring a full-time certified Arborist, with preference to current staff members, within 12 months. There was no second to the motion on the amendment.

After a lengthy discussion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan  
Voting Nay: Shipka

Kevin Smith presented the following bid tabulations for Chemicals & Fertilizers:

## TABULATION OF BIDS

Planning & Operations Department  
Date: December 8, 2017  
By: Justin Rogers, Planning Manager



### Mill Creek MetroParks – Chemicals and Fertilizers

BID OPENING: December 6, 2017

ESTIMATE: \$100,000.00



Name of Bidder	Total Amount of Bid as Read at Bid Opening	Total Amount of Bid After Tabulation	Lowest and Best Bid Total Amount
Harrell's LLC	\$42,664.99	\$42,664.99	<b>\$12,185.85</b>
SiteOne Landscape Supply	\$79,647.46	\$79,614.82	<b>\$13,627.00</b>
Crop Production Services	\$81,057.05	\$81,362.04	<b>\$32,629.92</b>
Residex LLC / Target Specialty	\$102,302.63	\$102,696.43	<b>\$11,234.80</b>
Walker Supply Inc.	\$101,499.44	\$101,346.70	<b>\$15,786.27</b>

**TOTAL: \$85,463.84**

#### NOTES:

1. Five (5) bids were received, checked and tabulated.
2. While several mathematical errors were found in the bids submitted, no errors adversely affect the ranking or quality of the bids.
3. Each line item (70 in total) is considered a complete bid, at the unit price submitted.
4. After tabulation, the low bidder for each individual item was determined by each bidder's lowest unit price bid. The low bid refers to the lowest and best bid that meets the specifications for each item listed within the contract documents.
5. The total amount for all of the lowest unit price bids is \$85,463.84. The bid tabulation sheet identifying each bid item, lowest unit price bid, and respective bidder, is attached to this document.
6. All required bonds, documents, forms and attachments were included within four of the five bids. The bid for Residex LLC/Target Specialty was missing two forms (Condensed Net Worth Statement and Qualifications Questionnaire).
7. All five (5) bidders are experienced in and capable of providing the products required in the specifications. The MetroParks has previously purchased materials from all five (5) bidders.

**RECOMMENDATIONS:**

1. Based upon the results of the bid tabulation sheet attached to this document, it is recommended that the contract for the materials bid project named "Mill Creek MetroParks – Chemicals and Fertilizers," with the total amount of \$85,463.84, be awarded to the following vendors at each respective amount (reflecting the total amount of each vendor's lowest and best unit price bids):

Harrell's LLC	3 items	\$12,185.85
SiteOne Landscape Supply	17 items	\$13,627.00
Crop Production Services (CPS)	28 items	\$32,629.92
Residex LLC/Target Specialty	9 items	\$11,234.80
Walker Supply Inc.	13 items	\$15,786.27
5 Vendors	70 Items	\$85,463.84

Lee Frey moved that the recommended contracts be approved. John Ragan seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
 Voting Nay: None

Kevin Smith presented the following Bid Tabulations for Gasoline and Fuel Oil:

**Mill Creek Metropolitan Park District  
 Gasoline/Fuel Oil Bids  
 Prepared By: James Ridge, Staff Accountant**

Guidelines asked of the bidders by Mill Creek Metropolitan Park District:

1. Use of O.P.I.S. Average PAD 2 Pricing as of 11/27/2017
2. Personal Property Tax Delinquency Affidavit
3. Statement of Proposers Qualifications
4. Non-Collusion Affidavit
5. Condensed Net Worth Statement

Company	O.P.I.S. PADD 2 Pricing	Personal Property Tax Delinquency Affidavit	Statement of Proposed Qualifications	Non-Collusion Affidavit	Condensed Net Worth Statement
Great Lakes Petroleum		X	X	X	
Ports Petroleum		X	X	X	X
Reed Oil Company	X	X	X	X	X

**RECOMMENDATION**

As per the Gasoline and Fuel Oil Bid Packet, The Board of Park Commissioners reserves the right to reject any, part of any or all bids, to waive any informality in the bidding process and to accept and bid they feel to be in the best interest of the park.

Reed Oil Company submitted the lowest price differential among all of the bids. They also submitted all of the required documents and used the correct PAD pricing. The other companies, both Great Lakes Petroleum and Ports Petroleum used the wrong pricing, as well as overbid compared to Reed Oil Company. Based on this, we recommend Reed Oil Company be our provider for fuel oil and diesel fuel.

Lee Frey moved that the bid of Reed Oil Company be approved. Tom Frost seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Brian Tolnar, Golf Director, presented the South Course Head Golf Professional Employment Agreement for 2018. Lee Frey moved that the Agreement be approved. John Ragan seconded the motion, and the vote taken resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Brian Tolnar requested that the Lease Agreement for Hole 55 at the Golf Course, with Valley Grille, LLC be renewed for one year. Lee Frey moved that the Agreement be approved. John Ragan seconded the motion. After discussion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Lee Frey presented Resolution R-17-17 as follows:

**R-17-17  
A RESOLUTION HONORING**

***John Ragan***

**For His Service to Mill Creek MetroParks**

**WHEREAS:** Mr. John Ragan served as a dedicated volunteer Mill Creek MetroParks Commissioner from 2010 through 2017 and represented his position with fairness and effectiveness; and

**WHEREAS:** Mr. Ragan has worked tirelessly to foster the development of Mill Creek MetroParks, and its mission to provide open space and recreational opportunities to the citizens of Mahoning County; and

**WHEREAS:** Mr. Ragan sought to advance Mill Creek MetroParks by supporting its efforts to preserve and improve the infrastructure of the MetroParks; by encouraging improvements to the trails, roads, and bridges; and had a significant interest in budgetary accountability, and

**WHEREAS:** Mr. Ragan was a familiar face on the trails and Golf Course; he took the time to talk to staff members, volunteers, and park users. Had a great appreciation for what it takes to

maintain the nearly 5,000 acres of grounds, conduct events, and oversee a financially stable organization. It was assuring to know that he not only knew what was going on in the MetroParks, but also took time to enjoy the activities as a visitor.

**WHEREAS:** Mr. Ragan was knowledgeable, considerate, and sensitive to the economics of the local community, the historic significance of the MetroParks, and brought a special passion to the MetroParks, both as a representative and as a life-long resident of the Mahoning Valley; and

**NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED:** That the Board of Park Commissioners publicly proclaims its sincere appreciation to Mr. Ragan for his outstanding service to, and heartfelt support of, Mill Creek MetroParks and community. A suitable copy of this Resolution shall be prepared and presented to Mr. Ragan, and an additional copy shall be placed in the permanent archives of Mill Creek MetroParks.

Lee Frey moved the resolution be approved, Germaine seconded the motion. After discussion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Steve Avery, Planning & Operations Director, presented Resolution R-17-18 as follows:

#### **R-17-18**

#### **IDORA BRIDGE IMPROVEMENTS**

**WHEREAS,** the Eastgate Regional Council of Governments (Eastgate), on behalf of the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) and the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT), administers financial assistance for FHWA's Surface Transportation Program (STP), as authorized by the Fixing America's Surface Transportation (FAST) Act, and

**WHEREAS,** Mill Creek MetroParks applied for FHWA STP funding in 2016 through Eastgate for improvements to the Idora Bridge on East Park Drive in Mill Creek Park at a total estimated cost of \$250,000, and

**WHEREAS,** Eastgate notified the MetroParks that the Idora Bridge Improvements project was selected for funding through FHWA's STP in fiscal year 2019 and authorized the construction cost for the project to be financed at 80%, and

**WHEREAS,** FHWA has designated the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT) as the agency in Ohio to administer federally funded transportation projects, and

**WHEREAS,** Section 5501.03 (C) of the Ohio Revised Code provides that the Director of ODOT may coordinate activities of the Department with other appropriate public authorities and enter into contracts with such authorities as necessary to carry out its duties, powers and functions, and

**WHEREAS**, it is the mutual desire of both ODOT and Mill Creek MetroParks to have the MetroParks serve as the responsible lead agency for the management of this project.

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, the Board of Park Commissioners of the Mill Creek Metropolitan Park District agree as follows:

1. The Mill Creek MetroParks' Executive Director is hereby authorized and directed to file the programming and environmental documents with ODOT, and to execute an Agreement with ODOT for the Idora Bridge Improvements project, and
2. The Mill Creek MetroParks' Executive Director is hereby authorized and directed to have plans and specifications prepared for advertisement of public bids for the project, and
3. The Board of Park Commissioners agrees to the future maintenance of the project, and
4. The Board of Park Commissioners agrees to pay all costs in excess of the funded amount.

Lee Frey moved the resolution be approved, John Ragan seconded the motion. After discussion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Lee Frey presented that the 7<sup>th</sup> Amended MetroParks Foundation Trust Agreements be given to our Attorney to review. The Board will present the reviewed agreement, at a later date, for approval by a unanimous vote of the Board. Tom Shipka seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

Lee Frey announced that the next Board Meeting is scheduled for 6 p.m., Monday, January 8, 2018, in McMahon Hall at the MetroParks Farm.

#### Commissioners Comments

- Tom Shipka thanked the staff, volunteers, and standing committees.

Tom Shipka made a motion regarding Fund-Raising on Behalf of the MetroParks as follows:

1. There will be a single fund-raising plan for the Mill Creek MetroParks. All fund-raising on behalf of the MetroParks will conform to this plan. This includes fund-raising by the Mill Creek MetroParks, the Friends of Fellows Riverside Gardens, and the Mill Creek MetroParks Foundation.
2. This plan will be developed annually by the MetroParks Development and submitted to the MetroParks Board of Commissioners for approval.
3. During the development of this plan, the Director of Development will consult the Standing Committee on Development of the Board of Commissioners of the MetroParks, the Friends of Fellows Riverside Gardens, and the Mill Creek MetroParks Foundation, to

ensure that they have input into the plan and that the plan integrates and coordinates all fund-raising on behalf of the MetroParks.

4. The Director of Development of the Metro Parks, who is employed by the MetroParks Board of Commissioners to raise funds for the MetroParks and who reports to the Executive Director of the MetroParks, will work with all MetroParks entities to raise funds for the MetroParks.

The motion was seconded by Tom Frost.

Germaine Bennett made a motion to amend the motion that Friends of Fellows Riverside Gardens is an independent 501c3 organization, whose mission is to support Fellows Riverside Gardens, and is not under the direction of or controlled by the MetroParks, however, discussion between the three groups will engender a spirit of development. Tom Frost seconded the motion for the amendment. After discussion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

After discussion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

- Tom Frost thanked John Ragan for his years of service to the MetroParks. He also thanked all of the employees. He expressed that he was happy that a middle-ground was agreed to regarding the Arborist position.
- John Ragan thanked his wife for being there for him during the difficult times on the Board. He thanked the Executive Director, Board members, and is honored and proud to be on the Board for 8 years.
- Germaine Bennett thanked John Ragan for his service on the volunteer board. She thanked the employees for doing a great job. She is encouraged by the dedication and spirit of cooperation between all entities.
- Lee Frey congratulated John Ragan for his dedication and perseverance through his 8 year tenure on the Board.

Lee announced that there will be discussion at the January 8, 2018, Board Meeting about the 2018 Board meeting schedule. They will go into Executive Session to discuss the Executive Director's evaluation, at the January 8, 2018, meeting.

There being no further business, Tom Frost moved to adjourn the meeting. Germaine Bennett seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Ragan, Shipka  
Voting Nay: None

The meeting adjourned at 7:01 p.m.