

TENTATIVE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE BOARD OF PARK COMMISSIONERS OF MILL CREEK METROPARKS HELD MONDAY, DECEMBER 17, 2018

A Regular Meeting of the Board of Park Commissioners of Mill Creek MetroParks was held on Monday, December 17, 2018, at the MetroParks Farm. President Lee Frey welcomed guests and staff.

The meeting opened at 6 p.m. with recitation of The Pledge of Allegiance. Roll Call was as follows: Germaine Bennett, present, Lee Frey, present; Tom Frost, present; Jeff Harvey, present, and Paul Olivier, present.

Germaine Bennett moved the Board meet in Executive Session to discuss Collective Bargaining Matters. Lee Frey seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Harvey, Olivier  
Voting Nay: None

The motion was passed, and the Board met in Executive Session at 6:02 p.m.

Lee Frey motioned to return to Regular Session. Germaine Bennett seconded the motion and the Board returned from Executive Session at 6:34 p.m. and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Harvey, Olivier  
Voting Nay: None

The Board was presented with the Minutes of the Meeting of November 19, 2018. Commissioner Frey moved that the minutes be accepted into the records.

Kevin Smith, Director of Finance/Treasurer introduced Jim Shaw, Youngstown Regional Liaison for the Auditor of the State of Ohio, who presented an award to the MetroParks for exemplary financial audits for 2016 & 2017. This award is only given to 10% of public entities. Kevin thanked Staff Accountant James Ridge for his work in making this award possible.

The Board congratulated the Finance Department on another clean financial audit.

Kevin presented the Treasurer's Report. Lee Frey moved, the funds having been certified as on hand and duly appropriated, that disbursements #77834 - #78123 for a total of \$987,710.45 be approved. The motion was seconded by Jeff Harvey and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Harvey, Olivier  
Voting Nay: None

Kevin made a request to increase account #100.0440.5056 by \$273,052.34, to Development Professional Services to transfer proceeds from the sale of the Beeghly House to the MCMP Foundation. Lee Frey moved the request be approved. Tom Frost seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost, Harvey, Olivier  
Voting Nay: None

Kevin made a request to decrease appropriations to fund 701 – Replacement Reserve Fund by \$3,500,000. This year end fund adjustment is needed to ensure that appropriations do not exceed the estimated resources in the fund at the end of the year. Lee Frey moved the request be approved. Tom Frost seconded the motion, and after a brief discussion, the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
 Voting Nay: None

Kevin presented the 2019 Temporary Budget. Lee Frey made a motion that the last line be amended as follows. Total 2018 2019 Temporary Budget. Germaine Bennett seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
 Voting Nay: None

Lee Frey motioned the 2019 Temporary Budget be approved. Jeff Harvey seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
 Voting Nay: None

Kevin presented the Gasoline and Fuel Oil Bid Tabulations:

Mill Creek Metropolitan Parks Oil Bids 2019				
			REQUIRED ITEMS	
			MSDS SHEETS	Yes
			PAD 2 PRICING	No
			NET WORTH	Will Prov.
Vendor:	Great Lakes Petroleum		STMT OF QUAL.	Yes
			PERSONAL PROP.	Yes
Product	O.P.I.S. AVERAGE PAD 2 11/26/18	SUBMITTED PRICE DIFFERENTIAL	BID PRICE PER GALLON	
REGULAR GRADE UNLEADED E-10 GASOLINE	\$1.5719	\$0.2200	\$1.7919	
MEDIUM GRADE UNLEADED E-10 GASOLINE	\$1.8053	\$0.2200	\$2.0253	
FUEL OIL (Off Road Use, Dyed Low Sulfur)	\$2.1043	\$0.2200	\$2.3243	
FUEL OIL (On Road Use, Ultra Low Sulfur)	\$2.0912	\$0.2200	\$2.3112	
NOTES: The company did not provide the proper PAD 2 pricing. Also, they will provide their Statement of Net Worth upon signing a Confidentiality Agreement.				
			REQUIRED ITEMS	
			MSDS SHEETS	NON COLLUSION
			PAD 2 PRICING	NET WORTH
Vendor:	Reed Oil		STMT OF QUAL.	PERSONAL PROP.
Product	O.P.I.S. AVERAGE PAD 2 11/26/18	SUBMITTED PRICE DIFFERENTIAL	BID PRICE PER GALLON	
REGULAR GRADE UNLEADED E-10 GASOLINE	\$1.5800	\$0.0200	\$1.6000	
MEDIUM GRADE UNLEADED E-10 GASOLINE	\$1.7925	\$0.0200	\$1.8125	
FUEL OIL (Off Road Use, Dyed Low Sulfur)	\$2.1530	\$0.0195	\$2.1725	
FUEL OIL (On Road Use, Ultra Low Sulfur)	\$2.1530	\$0.0195	\$2.1725	
NOTES: Add \$0.03 for winter additive on fuel oil from 12/1/18 - 3/1/19				
Recommendation:	It is my recommendation based on the bids provided that we continue our standing relations with Reed Oil Company for our fuel and oil needs. Reed Oil Company provided the lowest and best bid as well as the right documentation and followed the bid parameters.			

Lee Frey made a motion that the bid of Reed Oil be accepted as the best and lowest bid. Germaine Bennett seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
 Voting Nay: None

Kevin presented Chemicals and Fertilizers Bid Tabulations.

Mill Creek MetroParks – Chemicals and Fertilizers

BID OPENING: December 12, 2018 ESTIMATE: \$100,000.00

Name of Bidder	Total Amount of Bid as Read at Bid Opening	Total Amount of Bid After Tabulation	Lowest and Best Bid Total Amount
Advanced Turf Solutions	\$131,100.87	\$131,100.87	<b>\$6,966.52</b>
Target Specialty	\$37,694.77	\$37,694.77	<b>\$5,827.95</b>
Harrell's' LLC	\$92,770.19	\$92,770.19	<b>\$14,412.05</b>
Nutrien Ag Solutions	\$104,806.21	\$104,806.21	<b>\$37,204.75</b>
Siteone Landscape Supply	\$98,280.22	\$98,280.22	<b>\$33,305.43</b>
			<b>TOTAL: \$97,716.70</b>

NOTES:

- Five (5) bids were received, checked and tabulated.
- While several mathematical errors were found in the bids submitted, no errors adversely affect the ranking or quality of the bids.
- Each line item (80 in total) is considered a complete bid, at the unit price submitted.
- After tabulation, the low bidder for each individual item was determined by each bidder's lowest unit price bid. The low bid refers to the lowest and best bid that meets the specifications for each item listed within the contract documents.
- The total amount for all of the lowest unit price bids is \$97,716.70. The bid tabulation sheet identifying each bid item, lowest unit price bid, and respective bidder, is attached to this document.
- All required bonds, documents, forms and attachments were included within three of the five bids. The bid for Target Specialty was missing one form (Condensed Net Worth Statement, for which they gave a web address that it could be found). The bid for Harrell's, LLC was also missing one form (Condensed Net Worth Statement, for which they stated was confidential and to call with any questions).
- All five (5) bidders are experienced in and capable of providing the products required in the specifications. The MetroParks has previously purchased materials from all five (5) bidders.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. Based upon the results of the bid tabulation sheet attached to this document, it is recommended that the contract for the materials bid project named "Mill Creek MetroParks – Chemicals and Fertilizers," with the total amount of \$97,716.70, be awarded to the following vendors at each respective amount (reflecting the total amount of each vendor's lowest and best unit price bids):

Advanced Turf Solution	10 items	\$6,966.52
Target Specialty	7 items	\$5,827.95
Harrell's, LLC	7 items	\$14,412.05
Nutrien Ag Solutions	33 items	\$37,204.75
Siteone Landscape Supply	21 items	\$33,305.43
<hr/>		
5 Vendors	78 Items*	\$97,716.70

\*There were only 78 items bid on, even though we requested 80

Lee Frey made a motion that the bids accepted as indicated to be the best and lowest bid. Tom Frost seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
Voting Nay: None

Kevin presented the updated Credit Card Policy:

**Mill Creek MetroParks**

Corporate Credit Card Usage Policy

Prepared by: Kevin W. Smith, Finance Director/Treasurer

Date of Policy: December 17, 2018

Mill Creek MetroParks recognizes the value of an efficient method of payment and recordkeeping for certain expenses.

The Finance Director/Treasurer issues credit cards to all Department Directors, and, upon the Directors' request, Managers, and sets the credit limits and restrictions that best meet the needs of the MetroParks. **Itemized receipts must be returned substantiating the exact amount charged to the card.**

Purchase Orders

- Proper purchase order procedures must be followed, i.e. getting an approved Purchase Order prior to making a purchase.
- The Purchase Order vendor needs to be made out to the appropriate credit card provider (i.e. Visa), with the corresponding purchasing information listed in the description area.
- The Department Director will validate all purchases.

Authorized use of Mill Creek MetroParks' credit cards:

- In connection with Board-approved or MetroParks-related activities and that only those types of expenses that are for the benefit of the MetroParks and serve a valid and proper public purpose shall be paid for by credit cards.
- Business meals
- Room reservations, transportation fees, etc. for MetroParks employees when traveling on MetroParks business.
  - 15% gratuities are acceptable.

- The purchase of items where it is not readily feasible to establish an account, one-time only purchases, etc.
- On line purchases

Credit cards cannot be used for:

- Purchases that can otherwise be paid for using corporate checks
- Non-business related purchases
- Purchase of alcohol
- Sales tax
  - Tax-exempt documentation is available upon request from the Finance Department.

The Department Director is responsible to track expenses, and provide receipts timely, including online purchases that provide email confirmations.

Employees shall be responsible to make full reimbursement to the MetroParks within thirty days for any charges that were not supported with detailed itemized receipts.

The Finance Director/Treasurer annually must file a report with the legislative authority detailing all rewards received based on the use of the MetroParks' credit card account.

Card Number Security

- Corporate credit cards should be treated like other personal credit cards.
- The person whose name the corporate credit card is in is solely responsible for all purchases on the card and ensuring that their credit card number is not used by unauthorized personnel.

Termination, loss, theft, misuse

Upon the termination of employment of a cardholder for any reason, Department Directors are required to immediately call the Finance Director/Treasurer. All cards must be returned to the Finance Director/Treasurer. Employees are liable for any unauthorized use of a credit card. Any employee who suspects the loss, theft, or possibility of unauthorized use of a card must notify the Finance Director/Treasurer immediately. Inappropriate or illegal use of the card and/or failure to strictly adhere to the requirements set forth in the Finance Director/Treasurer's guidelines, including submitting detailed itemized receipts, may result in loss of credit card privileges, disciplinary action, up to and including termination, personal responsibility for any and all charges, including finance charges and interest assessed, and referral to law enforcement for prosecution. Under no circumstances shall cards be used for personal purchases or the purchase of alcoholic beverages. Use of credit cards for any cash withdrawal transaction is strictly prohibited.

Reviewed 5/2013  
 Updated 8/1/16  
 Updated 12/17/18

Lee Frey made a motion to accept the policy. Jeff Harvey seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
 Voting Nay: None

Justin Rogers presented the following Resolution:

**R-18-16**

**Resolution Authorizing MetroParks Executive Director to Apply for  
 Clean Ohio Conservation Program Funds**

**WHEREAS**, the Board of Park Commissioners of the Mill Creek Metropolitan Park District, operating under Chapter 1545 of the Ohio Revised Code, intends to apply to the Ohio Public Works Commission for Clean Ohio Conservation Program Funds.

**NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, that the MetroParks Executive Director is hereby authorized to apply, on behalf of the Board of Park Commissioners, to the Ohio Public Works Commission for Clean Ohio Conservation Program funds, and

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that the MetroParks Executive Director is further authorized to enter into any agreements as may be necessary and appropriate for obtaining this financial assistance.

Lee Frey made a motion to accept the policy. Germaine Bennett seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
Voting Nay: None

Aaron Young, Executive Director, presented the AFSCME union contract for 2019, 2020, & 2021. Lee Frey made a motion to accept the proposed contract. Paul Olivier seconded the motion. The Board was happy with the good job done on negotiating the contract, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
Voting Nay: None

Brian Tolnar presented the Hole 55 Golf Course Restaurant Lease for the 2019 season for approval. Lee Frey made a motion to accept the Lease. The motion was seconded by Germaine Bennett, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
Voting Nay: None

Brian Tolnar presented the 2019 Employment Agreement between the MetroParks and Golf Pro Andy Santor for approval. Lee Frey made a motion to accept the Lease. The motion was seconded by Tom Frost, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey, Olivier  
Voting Nay: None

Carol Vigorito, Recreation & Education Director, presented a Special Event Request for Meridian Healthcare to hold a run/walk fundraiser on February 2, 2019. Lee Frey moved that the request be approved. The motion was seconded by Germaine Bennett, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye: Bennett, Frey, Frost Harvey  
Voting Nay: None  
Abstain: Olivier

Executive Director's Report (Aaron Young, Executive Director)

1. MCTA Liaison: Bob Toman, Ellsworth Township Trustee
2. Officer Recognition
  - a. Recognize Det. Sgt. Clark for successfully completing the Police Executive Leadership College on 11/16

- b. Sgt. Novosel for successful completion of the Supervisor Training Education Program on 11/14.

Chris Litton, Development Director, gave an update on the Giving Tuesday promotion.

Most of the Standing Committees to the Board of Park Commissioners of Mill Creek MetroParks have turned in their 2018 Annual Report, and 2019 Goals. These are posted on the MetroParks website. Lee Frey instructed the Office Manager to send out a reminder to those who haven't done so yet.

#### Commissioners Comments

- Jeff Harvey – Merry Christmas; enjoyed time on Board in 2018, was impressed what he sees; wishes everyone a good 2019
- Paul Olivier – Happy Holidays; was a pleasure to serve this first year; the park is steadfast and an asset to the community.
- Germaine Bennett – Merry Christmas; thanked the Judge for his Board appointees, great group to work with; thanked the committees for their reports.
- Tom Frost – Merry Christmas; 2018 was a great year, and he's impressed with the work and progress of the staff; thanked the Board, the staff, and Aaron.
- Lee Frey – Thanked the dedicated hardworking staff, Board; thanked Aaron for his leadership and cooperation; and thanked Mandy for her behind the scenes work.
- Judge Rusu – Thanked the employees and volunteers; said the Gardens & Building were beautiful and mostly decorated by the volunteers.

Public Comments to the Board - none

Lee Frey announced that the next meeting is scheduled for Monday, January 14, 2019, at 6 p.m. at the MetroParks Farm.

There being no further business, Lee Frey moved to adjourn the meeting. Jeff Harvey seconded the motion, and the roll being called upon its adoption, the vote resulted as follows:

Voting Aye:	Bennett, Frey, Frost, Harvey, Olivier
Voting Nay:	None

The meeting adjourned at 7:04 p.m.